Sosioedukasi
JURNAL ILMIAH ILMU PENDIDIKAN DAN SOSIAL
ISSN: 2086-6135 E-ISSN: 2541-612x
Volume 15 No. 4 Desember 2026 https://ejournal.unibabwi.ac.id/index.php/sosioedukasi/index

POLICY CONFLICT IN THE ARRANGEMENT OF STREET VENDORS IN THE GADING FAJAR AREA, SIDOARJO REGENCY

Ivan Cahya Putra Bahari[1a*], Diana Hertati[2b]

[12]Program Studi S-1 Administrasi Publik, Fakultas Ilmu Sosial Budaya dan Politik,
Universitas Pembangunan Nasional Veteran Jawa Timur, Surabaya, Indonesia

[a]*E-mail: ivan0609202@gmail.com*
[b]*E-mail: diana_hertati.adneg@upnjatim.ac.id*

(*) Corresponding Author
ivan0609202@gmail.com (0895366486989)

ARTICLE HISTORY

Received : 08-05-2026
Revised : 09-07-2026
Accepted : 19-10-2026

KEYWORDS

Policy Conflict,
Street Vendors,
Policy Implementation,
Policy Conflict Framework,
Gading Fajar

ABSTRACT

This study examines the dynamics of policy conflict in the regulation of street vendors (PKL) in the Gading Fajar area, Sidoarjo Regency, using the Policy Conflict Framework developed by Christopher M. Weible and Tanya Heikkila. A descriptive qualitative approach was employed through observation, interviews, and documentation. The findings indicate that the conflict is driven by the gap between policy formulation and implementation, limited relocation facilities, weak institutional coordination, and differing stakeholder interests. The conflict evolved from latent tensions into open confrontation due to the absence of sustainable relocation solutions and the emergence of opposing coalitions between government actors and street vendors. Furthermore, the policy outcomes remain temporary and have not yet provided a sustainable long-term resolution. This study concludes that the regulation of street vendors requires a more participatory and sustainable policy approach through strengthened stakeholder dialogue, improved inter-agency coordination, and the integration of empowerment programs alongside regulatory measures. This study also contributes to the development of policy conflict studies within the context of urban governance and informal sector regulation.

This is an open access article under the CC–BY-SA license.

INTRODUCTION

By 2050, the global urban population is projected to increase by at least 2.5 billion people (Peimani & Kamalipour, 2022). This challenge is particularly significant in most regions of the Global South, where informal employment accounts for more than half of total employment and self-employment exceeds wage employment. Among forms of self-employment, street vending is one of the most visible occupations; however, only a few cities have successfully balanced the need to support livelihoods with the need to manage public space effectively (Roever & Skinner, 2016). One of the main issues faced by most developing countries is how to utilize their large and predominantly unskilled human resources for development, as approximately 30% to 70% of the urban workforce employed in the informal sector consists of migrants from rural areas or

Sosioedukasi
JURNAL ILMIAH ILMU PENDIDIKAN DAN SOSIAL
ISSN: 2086-6135 E-ISSN: 2541-612x
Volume 15 No. 4 Desember 2026 https://ejournal.unibabwi.ac.id/index.php/sosioedukasi/index

other regions (Widodo as cited in (Kurniadi & Ibrahim, 2023). In many parts of the world, street vendors constitute an integral part of the informal economy and labor market by providing goods and services to low-income urban residents in various easily accessible locations throughout cities (Uwamahoro & Khoo, 2025).

Street vendors (PKL) are informal sector actors who conduct economic activities in public spaces, both on government- and privately-owned land, generally on a temporary or non-permanent basis. Street vendors are an important form of independent entrepreneurship in developing countries, involving a large number of men and women Rajabu as cited in(Eya et al., 2025). The term PKL commonly refers to vendors using carts and is often associated with the concept of "five feet," consisting of two human feet and three supporting points of the cart (Pitaloka et al., 2021). Street vendors provide significant employment opportunities and sources of livelihood for the community (Widjajanti et al., 2025). Furthermore, PKL are characterized as informal entrepreneurs who sell goods or services in either fixed or mobile locations using simple facilities such as carts or shoulder poles (Larasati et al., 2021). Their presence has become an inseparable part of urban economic dynamics and reflects the expansion of community-based informal economic activities.

The existence of the informal sector, including street vendors, is closely associated with citizens' rights to obtain decent work and livelihood as guaranteed in Article 27 paragraph (2) of the 1945 Constitution of the Republic of Indonesia. Informal economic activities function as an alternative source of employment amid the limited capacity of the formal sector to absorb labor. Manning and Effendi as cited in (L. S. Y. Putri & Choiriyah, 2021), attribute the rapid growth of the informal sector in urban areas to the imbalance between labor force growth and the availability of formal employment opportunities. Studies on urban governance and street trading have predominantly focused on analyzing the negative consequences of overly confrontational practices, such as the eviction of street traders, while often overlooking the complexities of alternative policies, including efforts toward the spatial formalization of street trading (Bandauko & Arku, 2025). This condition is further intensified by urbanization, which increases population concentration in urban areas and encourages communities to rely on informal economic activities as a means of economic survival. The increasing unemployment rate and the expansion of informal economic activities in urban areas have contributed to the growth of street vendors in several regions, including Sidoarjo Regency.

Table 1. Regency/City with the Highest Unemployment Rates in East Java

No	Regency/Cities	2024
1.	Sidoarjo Regency	6,49 %
2.	Gresik Regency	6,45 %
3.	Malang City	6,10 %
4.	Bangkalan Regency	5,35 %
	Malang Regency	5,13 %
6.	Blitar City	5,11 %
7.	Kediri Regency	5,10 %
8.	Pasuruan Regency	5,02 %
9.	Surabaya City	4,91 %
10.	Blitar Regency	4,77 %

Source: East Java Central Statistics Agency, 2024

Statistical data presented in Table 1 indicate that Sidoarjo Regency recorded the highest unemployment rate in East Java, reaching 6.49%. This condition has encouraged many residents to enter the informal sector, particularly street vending activities, as an alternative source of income (Rozaq & Rodiyah, 2022). The Gading Fajar area has become one of the main concentrations of street vendors due to its strategic location and high accessibility. Consequently, the number of street vendors in Sidoarjo Regency has continued to increase significantly.

One of the main concentrations of street vendors in Sidoarjo Regency is located in the Gading Fajar area. Its strategic location and high accessibility have made the area attractive for informal trading activities. In addition, the large number of micro-enterprises operating in the area reflects the intensity of informal economic activities within the region (E. R. A. Putri et al., 2023). These conditions position Gading Fajar not only as a center of economic activity but also as an area vulnerable

Sosioedukasi
JURNAL ILMIAH ILMU PENDIDIKAN DAN SOSIAL
ISSN: 2086-6135 E-ISSN: 2541-612x
Volume 15 No. 4 Desember 2026 https://ejournal.unibabwi.ac.id/index.php/sosioedukasi/index

to various urban management problems. The distribution of street vendors across several locations in Sidoarjo Regency is presented in the table below.

Table 2. Number of Street Vendors in Sidoarjo Regency in 2023

No	Area Name	Amount
1	Gading Fajar	1.210
2	Taman Pinang	341
3	Jl Majapahit & Gajahmada	60
4	Grahakota	59

Source: Cooperatives and Micro Enterprises Service of Sidoarjo Regency, 2024

The data demonstrate that the Gading Fajar area accommodates approximately 1,210 street vendors, far exceeding other locations such as Majapahit and Gajah Mada Streets with 60 vendors, the Taman Pinang Indah area with 341 vendors, and the Graha Kota area with 59 vendors. The high concentration of street vendors in the Gading Fajar area has contributed to several urban problems, including traffic congestion, environmental cleanliness issues, and the misuse of public facilities. (Kusumawardani & Kriswibowo, 2024) emphasize that the concentration of street vendors in this area is strongly influenced by the limited availability of officially designated trading spaces. Consequently, the increasing use of public spaces for informal economic activities has generated tensions between the need for urban spatial order and the economic interests of street vendors. The growing presence of street vendors in public spaces has also triggered conflicts between the government, vendors, and surrounding communities. (Jainuri & Hendra Sukmana, 2022) emphasize that these conflicts emerge from competing interests between government actors seeking to maintain spatial order and street vendors who depend on public spaces for their livelihoods.

The governance concept and managerial capacity of local governments in regulating the street vendor economy are also important factors influencing the governance model of the street vendor economy (Wang et al., 2024). As a response to these challenges, the Sidoarjo Regency Government enacted Regional Regulation No. 3 of 2016 concerning the Arrangement and Empowerment of Street Vendors as a legal framework for managing and regulating street vendor activities. The policy aims to create public order, maintain the function of public facilities, and empower vendors through the provision of designated trading areas and business development programs (Kusumawardani & Kriswibowo, 2024). In the context of policy implementation, two major approaches are commonly used to analyze implementation processes, namely top-down and bottom-up approaches. The top-down approach emphasizes hierarchical control and views policy implementation as a process directed by policymakers toward implementing actors (Hertati, 2020)

However, despite the existence of regulatory frameworks, the implementation of street vendor management policies in the Gading Fajar area continues to encounter significant challenges, including resistance to relocation policies perceived as economically disadvantageous and weak law enforcement mechanisms. These conditions indicate that the arrangement of street vendors in the Gading Fajar area extends beyond a technical administrative issue and reflects complex policy conflicts involving multiple stakeholders with differing interests and objectives.

METHOD

This study employed a descriptive qualitative approach to analyze the dynamics of policy conflict in the regulation of street vendors (PKL) in the Gading Fajar area, Sidoarjo Regency. A qualitative approach was selected because it enables an in-depth understanding of social phenomena within their natural context and facilitates the interpretation of meanings constructed by the actors involved (Denzin & Lincoln, as cited in (Sidiq & Choiri, 2019). The analysis was guided by the Policy Conflict Framework developed by (Weible & Heikkila, 2017), which consists of three analytical dimensions: policy setting, conflict episodes, and outcomes and feedback.

The research was conducted in the Gading Fajar 2 area of Sidoarjo Regency, which was purposively selected due to the high concentration of street vendors and the complexity of policy conflicts surrounding vendor regulation in the area. Informants were determined through purposive sampling, a technique that involves selecting participants based on their relevance, experience, and direct involvement in the policy issue under study (Abdussamad, 2021). The selected informants

Sosioedukasi
JURNAL ILMIAH ILMU PENDIDIKAN DAN SOSIAL
ISSN: 2086-6135 E-ISSN: 2541-612x
Volume 15 No. 4 Desember 2026 https://ejournal.unibabwi.ac.id/index.php/sosioedukasi/index

comprised street vendors, officials from the Department of Cooperatives and Micro Enterprises, municipal police officers (Satpol PP), village government representatives, community leaders, and representatives of street vendor associations.

Data collection was carried out using non-participant observation, semi-structured interviews, and documentation review. Non-participant observation was undertaken to examine the actual conditions and interactions occurring in the research setting. Semi-structured interviews were conducted to obtain detailed insights into the perspectives, interests, and experiences of the actors involved in the policy conflict. Documentation review was utilized to support and verify empirical findings through relevant official documents, regulations, photographs, and field records Sugiyono, as cited in (Sidiq & Choiri, 2019). The data were analyzed using the interactive model proposed by (B.Miles et al., 2014), which includes four interconnected stages: data collection, data condensation, data display, and conclusion drawing/verification. The conclusion-drawing process was conducted continuously through verification to ensure consistency and accuracy between the empirical findings and the interpretation of the data.

To ensure the credibility and trustworthiness of the findings, this study applied triangulation techniques, including source triangulation and method triangulation, by comparing information obtained from different informants and data collection methods Denzin, as cited in (Susanto et al., 2023). Through these procedures, the study aimed to produce a comprehensive and empirically grounded understanding of policy conflict in the regulation of street vendors in the Gading Fajar area, Sidoarjo Regency.

RESULT AND DISCUSSION

Based on the data and findings obtained through interviews, observations, and documentation, this study demonstrates that the dynamics of policy conflict in the regulation of street vendors (PKL) in the Gading Fajar area, Sidoarjo Regency, can be systematically analyzed using the Policy Conflict Framework developed by (Weible & Heikkila, 2017), The framework emphasizes that policy conflict emerges not merely from differences in interests, but also from institutional arrangements, actor interactions, and feedback processes that continuously shape policy implementation. The findings reveal that the conflict surrounding street vendor regulation is multidimensional and cyclical, involving interconnected processes across the dimensions of policy setting, conflict episodes, and outcomes and feedback. As part of the policy coordination process, the Department of Cooperatives and Micro Enterprises of Sidoarjo Regency conducted an internal meeting to discuss the arrangement and management of street vendors (PKL) in the Gading Fajar area.

The image above illustrates a meeting focused on evaluating existing policies, coordinating institutional roles, and identifying appropriate strategies to address the challenges associated with regulating street vendors in the area. Nevertheless, the conflict persists because the institutional design of the policy has not been fully supported by adequate implementation capacity. Limited relocation facilities, insufficient resources, and weak cross-sectoral coordination between government agencies have reduced the effectiveness of policy implementation from the planning stage to supervision and enforcement. In the perspective of the Policy Conflict Framework, these institutional limitations create structural conditions that intensify policy disputes, particularly when policy objectives concerning spatial order directly intersect with the economic interests of street vendors who depend on strategic public spaces for their livelihoods. Moreover, the unequal involvement of street vendors in the decision-making process has contributed to perceptions of exclusion and injustice, thereby strengthening resistance toward government policies. Consequently, the incompatibility between policy design and implementation readiness has become a major causal factor behind the recurring nature of the conflict. The escalation of conflict can further be observed through interactions between actors during policy implementation and enforcement processes. The following documentation illustrates the control and enforcement actions carried out by the Municipal Police (Satpol PP) toward street vendors operating in the Gading Fajar area.

Sosioedukasi
JURNAL ILMIAH ILMU PENDIDIKAN DAN SOSIAL
ISSN: 2086-6135 E-ISSN: 2541-612x
Volume 15 No. 4 Desember 2026 https://ejournal.unibabwi.ac.id/index.php/sosioedukasi/index



Figure 1. Internal Coordination Meeting of the Department of Cooperatives and Micro Enterprises of Sidoarjo Regency
Source: Department of Cooperatives and Micro Enterprises of Sidoarjo Regency, 2026

Within the conflict episodes dimension, the findings reveal that the conflict evolved progressively from latent tensions into open confrontation. Initially, disagreements emerged in the form of dissatisfaction among street vendors regarding relocation policies and enforcement measures. However, the absence of sustainable solutions and clear relocation alternatives intensified distrust toward the government, which subsequently transformed the conflict into more visible forms of resistance, including protests and demonstrations. In line with the framework proposed by Weible and Heikkila, the conflict became more polarized due to the formation of competing coalitions with opposing policy beliefs and interests. On one side, the pro-enforcement coalition consisting of government institutions and several community leaders emphasized public order, spatial management, and regulatory compliance. On the other side, the anti-enforcement coalition composed of street vendors and their associations prioritized economic survival and access to strategic trading spaces. Because both coalitions maintained contrasting policy preferences and lacked collaborative mechanisms for negotiation, the conflict continuously escalated and hindered the achievement of comprehensive policy solutions.



Figure 2. Satpol PP Carries Out Control of Gading Fajar Street Vendors
Source: Civil Service Police Unit of Sidoarjo Regency, 2026

The findings show that the implementation of street vendor regulation policies has not generated sustainable policy outcomes because the government response remains dominated by temporary enforcement measures and short-term guidance programs rather than long-term structural solutions. As explained in the Policy Conflict Framework, ineffective policy outcomes often produce feedback mechanisms that reinforce future conflicts. This pattern is evident in the responses of various actors involved in the policy process. Satpol PP tends to implement the policy normatively through enforcement actions, while the Department of Cooperatives and Micro Enterprises emphasizes evaluation and empowerment programs. At the same time, street vendors continue to demonstrate resistance due to uncertainty regarding business relocation and economic security, whereas surrounding communities experience negative impacts related to disorder and public space management. These differing responses create feedback loops that continuously reproduce distrust, dissatisfaction, and

Sosioedukasi
JURNAL ILMIAH ILMU PENDIDIKAN DAN SOSIAL
ISSN: 2086-6135 E-ISSN: 2541-612x
Volume 15 No. 4 Desember 2026 https://ejournal.unibabwi.ac.id/index.php/sosioedukasi/index

institutional tension among actors. Therefore, weaknesses in policy setting have contributed to the escalation of conflict episodes, which subsequently produced ineffective policy outcomes and negative feedback. The interaction among these three dimensions ultimately forms a repetitive cycle of policy conflict, indicating that the regulation of street vendors in the Gading Fajar area has not yet achieved an integrated, participatory, and sustainable policy resolution.

Figure 3. Demonstration by Students and Street Vendors, the Current Situation of Street Vendors in the Gading Fajar Area



Source: Researcher's Documentation, 2026

CONCLUSION

Based on the research findings, the dynamics of policy conflict in the regulation of street vendors (PKL) in the Gading Fajar area, Sidoarjo Regency, indicate that the conflict has not yet been fully resolved. Using the Policy Conflict Framework developed by Christopher M. Weible and Tanya Heikkila, this study shows that the gap between policy formulation and implementation, limited relocation facilities, weak coordination, and differences in stakeholder interests have contributed to recurring conflicts. The conflict evolved from a latent phase into open confrontation due to the absence of clear and sustainable solutions, while the policy outcomes remain temporary and have not provided long-term resolution.

Therefore, the government needs to implement a more participatory and sustainable approach by strengthening stakeholder dialogue, improving coordination among institutions, and integrating empowerment programs for street vendors alongside regulatory measures. Academically, this study contributes to the development of policy conflict studies in the context of urban governance and informal sector regulation. Future research is recommended to examine the long-term effectiveness of relocation and empowerment policies in different regional contexts to provide broader insights into sustainable conflict resolution strategies.

ACKNOWLEDGMENT

During the preparation of this work the authors used Artificial Intelligence (AI) in order to improve the language and readability of the manuscript. After using this tool, the authors reviewed and edited the content as needed and take full responsibility for the content of the publication.

REFERENCES

Abdussamad, Z. (2021). *Metode Penelitian Kualitatif* (P. Rapanna, Ed.; Cetakan Pe). CV Syakir Media Press.

Bandauko, E., & Arku, G. (2025). 'They want to get rid of us by all means': A critical analysis of policy and governance responses and their implications for street traders' access to urban space in Harare, Zimbabwe. *Sage Publications*. https://doi.org/10.1177/23996544241298414

B.Miles, M., Huberman, A. M., & Saldan, J. (2014). Qualitative Data Analysis: A Methods Sourcebook. In *Sage Publications* (Vol. 11, Issue 1).

Eya, M. A., Abdullahi, S., & Liman, A. A. (2025). Exploring Measures of Incorporating Street Vending as a Legal Way of Sustaining Community Livelihood and the Viability of Nation' s Economy. *International Journal of Research and Innovation in Applied Science*, *10*(7), 946–962. https://doi.org/10.51584/IJRIAS

Sosioedukasi
JURNAL ILMIAH ILMU PENDIDIKAN DAN SOSIAL
ISSN: 2086-6135 E-ISSN: 2541-612x
Volume 15 No. 4 Desember 2026 https://ejournal.unibabwi.ac.id/index.php/sosioedukasi/index

Hertati, D. (2020). Model Implementasi sistem informasi pemerintahan desa berbasis web bagi pemerintahaN desa di Kabupaten Sidoarjo. *Dinamika Governance: Jurnal Ilmu Administrasi Negara*, *10*(1). https://doi.org/10.33005/jdg.v10i1.2049

Jainuri, M., & Hendra Sukmana. (2022). Evaluasi Kebijakan Relokasi Pedagang Kaki Lima di Sentra Kuliner Gajah Mada Sidoarjo. *Publikauma: Jurnal Administrasi Publik Universitas Medan Area*, *10*(2), 107–115. https://doi.org/10.31289/publika.v10i2.7751

Kurniadi, & Ibrahim, S. (2023). Street Vendor Governance in the Dimensions of Democracy, Collaboration, and Trust. *Sage Publications*, (25), 1–19. https://doi.org/10.1177/21582440231216178

Kusumawardani, E., & Kriswibowo, A. (2024). Evaluasi Peraturan Daerah Kabupaten Sidoarjo Nomor 3 Tahun 2016. *Jdp (Jurnal Dinamika Pemerintahan)*, *7*(1), 58–69. https://doi.org/10.36341/jdp.v7i1.3909

Larasati, D. C., N, Z. S., & Djua, M. (2021). Implementasi Kebijakan Pemerintah Daerah dalam Menertibkan Pedagang Kaki Lima (PKL). *JISIP: Jurnal Ilmu Sosial Dan Ilmu Politik*, *10*(3), 193–201. https://doi.org/10.33366/jisip.v10i3.2313

Peimani, N., & Kamalipour, H. (2022). Informal Street Vending: A Systematic Review. *Land*, *11*(6), 1–21.

Pitaloka, A. F., Nuswanto, A. H., & Sihotang, A. P. (2021). Implementasi Penataan Pedagang Kaki Lima Di Kabupaten Semarang. *Semarang Law Review (SLR)*, *2*(3), 176–189.

Putri, E. R. A., Puspaningtyas, A., & Soesiantoro, A. (2023). Evaluasi Penataan Pedagang Kaki Lima (PKL) Pada Ruang Terbuka Hijau (RTH) Di Kota Surabaya (Studi Kasus: Taman Bungkul Kota Surabaya). *Jurnal Penelitian Administrasi Publik*, *3*(5), 76–88.

Putri, L. S. Y., & Choiriyah, I. U. (2021). Analisis Dampak Sosial Ekonomi Keberadaan Pedagang Kaki Lima. *Indonesia Journal of Public Policy Review*, *14*.

Roever, S., & Skinner, C. (2016). Street vendors and cities. *Sage Publications*, *28*(2), 359–374. https://doi.org/10.1177/0956247816653898

Rozaq, M. A., & Rodiyah, I. (2022). Implementasi Kebijakan Penataan Pedagang Kaki Lima di Kabupaten Sidoarjo. *Indonesia Journal of Public Policy Review*, *20*.

Sidiq, U., & Choiri, M. M. (2019). *Metode Penelitian Kualitatif di Bidang Pendidikan* (A. Mujahidin, Ed.; Cetakan Pe). CV Nata Karya.

Susanto, D., Risnita, & Jailani, M. S. (2023). Teknik Pemeriksaan Keabsahan Data Dalam Penelitian Ilmiah. *Jurnal QOSIM Jurnal Pendidikan Sosial & Humaniora*, *1*(1), 53–61. https://doi.org/10.61104/jq.v1i1.60

Uwamahoro, M. C., & Khoo, E. (2025). Forced to Move: A Scoping Review of Research on the Vulnerability of Street Vendors in the Context of Urban Development in Sub-Saharan Africa. *Social Sciences*, *14*(645), 1–16.

Wang, M., Yang, L., & Li, C. (2024). Comparative Analysis of Economic Governance Models for Street Vendors Across Urban Scales——A Case Study of Suzhou, Jiaxing, and Taicang. *SHS Web of Conferences*, *192*(01006), 1–6.

Weible, C. M., & Heikkila, T. (2017). Policy Conflict Framework. *Policy Sciences*, *50*, 23–40. https://doi.org/10.1007/s11077-017-9280-6

Widjajanti, R., Kurniawati, W., Kurniawan, A., Murbana, P. A. F., & Saputri, W. A. E. (2025). Surviving under limitations: Street vendors' self -organized adaptation to limited infrastructure in urban public space. *International Journal of Innovative Research and Scientific Studies*, *8*(4), 1882–1896. https://doi.org/10.53894/ijirss.v8i4.8258