

EVALUATION OF ZONING SYSTEM POLICY ON THE ADMISSION OF NEW STUDENTS AT THE STATE HIGH SCHOOL LEVEL OF BALIKPAPAN CITY

Adji Puteri Mila Maharani^{1a}, Friska Prastya Harlis^{2b}

¹²The Faculty of Social and Political Science, Public Administration, Mulawarman University,
East Kalimantan, Indonesia

^a todjiputerimila@gmail.com

^b friskaprastya@fisip.unmul.ac.id

(*) Corresponding Author

todjiputerimila@gmail.com

ARTICLE HISTORY

Received : 05-05-2025

Revised : 15-05-2025

Accepted : 17-05-2025

KEYWORDS

Policy Evaluation,
PPDB Zoning,
SMAN Balikpapan

ABSTRACT

The zoning pathway is one of the registration pathways in the context of PPDB. This zoning policy demonstrates the government's commitment to ensure that all citizens have access to quality education at the national level. This policy was enacted to break the stigma between schools that are considered favorites and non-favorites. In this case, East Kalimantan Province has implemented a zoning system on PPDB at the high school level, especially in the city of Balikpapan. The purpose of this study is to evaluate the zoning system policy on the admission of new students at the State High School level in Balikpapan City. The research method used is qualitative descriptive with a literature review approach where the primary source is obtained from previous journals and supported by interviews with related sources. The results of this study state that the implementation of the zoning system at the State High School Level PPDB can be said to be quite effective, but with the limitations of State High Schools in the city of Balikpapan, it is a challenge for the government in terms of providing school infrastructure in each sub-district.

This is an open access article under the CC-BY-SA license.



INTRODUCTIONS

Education is an important component in the development of a nation's human resources. Education is a procedure designed to provide information about the existence of a nation and state. It is based on scientific and technological advances, as well as social, cultural, and religious values. This is in accordance with paragraph 1 of article 31 of the 1945 Constitution which states, "That every citizen has the right to receive education". The philosophical foundation of human rights is illustrated in this article, which emphasizes the right of every citizen to get education in order to educate the life of the nation. The Indonesian government improves the quality of education

through various programs, including early childhood education to secondary education and higher education. The zoning system is a system that requires new students to choose a school with the closest radius according to the student's domicile. The New Student Admission Policy (PPDB) with a zoning system is an alternative policy in overcoming various problems in student admissions at schools. The government has implemented this policy in various regions in Indonesia, since 2016.

In Indonesia, the PPDB policy with a zoning system is implemented with the aim of improving various national education standards such as curriculum, teacher distribution, student distribution and quality of facilities and infrastructure, based on zoning (Effendy: 2019). However, the implementation of the new zoning policy has been carried out gradually since 2016. This year, the zoning system was held at the National Exam (UN). Then it was only in 2017 that the zoning system was first implemented in PPDB based on Permendikbud Number 17 of 2017. Furthermore, the Permendikbud was revised and replaced with Permendikbud Number 14 of 2018 concerning the Admission of New Students in Kindergartens, Elementary Schools, Junior High Schools, Senior High Schools and Vocational Schools, or other equivalent forms. At the end of 2018, the Permendikbud was also replaced with Permendikbud No.51 of 2018 concerning the Admission of New Students. However, in its implementation there are weaknesses, one of which is the limited achievement path quota which is only 5 percent. Departing from this, it is one of the driving factors for the issuance of a presidential instruction that aims to re-evaluate the PPDB zoning system. Based on the phenomenon that occurred, the Minister of Education and Culture in June 2019 revised Permendikbud Number 51 of 2018 and then issued a Circular Letter of the Minister of Education and Culture Number 3 of 2019 concerning Amendments to the Regulation of the Minister of Education and Culture Number 51 of 2018 concerning the Admission of New Students in Kindergartens, Elementary Schools, Senior High Schools and Vocational High Schools. The letter contains the provisions of the percentage in PPDB: 1) The zoning path which was originally at least 90% to 80% of the school's capacity; 2) The achievement path with a maximum of 5% to 15% of the school's capacity; and 3) The Transfer Pathway of parents/guardians remains at most 5% of the school's capacity. Furthermore, the SE of the Minister of Education and Culture No. 3 of 2019 was promulgated in the State Gazette of the Republic of Indonesia Number 669 in Jakarta on June 20, 2019 to become Permendikbud Number 20 of 2019 concerning the Admission of New Students. However, at the end of 2019, the PPDB regulation with the zoning system was also replaced by Permendikbud Number 44 of 2019. Based on Permendikbud Number 44 of 2019, PPDB with zoning is currently being implemented in Indonesia.

Then, in accordance with the provisions of Permendikbud No. 44 of 2019, it is stipulated that the main purpose of the PPDB zoning system policy is to increase access to educational services as well as guidelines for regional heads to make technical policies and school principals in implementing PPDB. In depth, the Minister of Education and Culture emphasized that the PPDB zoning system also aims to provide access and justice to education for the community. In addition, it also aims to eliminate the stigma of "favorite school". Because so far, favorite schools are often synonymous with smart students and have middle-to-upper economic abilities and also have the goal of minimizing the distance students travel from home to school (Muhadjir Effendy: 2019). In Balikpapan City, the implementation of the zoning system at the State High School (SMA) level has been going on for the past few years. This city has its own challenges in the implementation of the zoning system, considering geographical conditions, population density, and uneven distribution of schools. This has led to various dynamics in the field, such as access inequality, the emergence of perceptions of injustice, and the practice of domicile manipulation. When compared to other cities in East Kalimantan, one of them is the city of Samarinda which has a total of 20 State High Schools, while the number of State High Schools in Balikpapan City is only 9 schools. The school is divided into 3 zones, where zone 1 is SMAN 1, SMAN 3 and SMAN 8. Zone 2 is SMAN 2, SMAN 6 and SMAN 9. Zone 3 is SMAN 4, SMAN 5 and SMAN 7. The number of State Junior High School graduates in Balikpapan City is 28 schools.

Based on a report by the Balikpapan City Education Office, only about 67 percent of junior high school graduates can be accepted into 15 State High Schools and Vocational Schools. The rest switched to the private sector. The lack of the number of State High Schools in Balikpapan City is certainly an anxiety for parents and prospective students who want to enter public schools. This problem still occurs repeatedly every year, caused by the limited availability of land in Balikpapan City that hinders the construction of schools, the limited land is certainly also an obstacle for other cities that have a high demand for education. The second problem is regarding the student admission quota, the zoning system in Balikpapan consists of a student quota that has been set for each school. If the quota at a certain school is not enough, then the quota problem will arise.

RESEARCH METHODS

The research method used in this study is qualitative descriptive with a literature review approach where the primary source is obtained from previous journals and supported by interviews with related sources. According to Sugiyono (2020:105) states that in general there are 4 (four) types of data collection techniques, namely observation, interview, documentation and combined/triangulation (observation, interview and observation). The focus of this research is on the evaluation of the zoning system policy on the admission of new students (PPDB) at the State High School level in Balikpapan City.

RESULT AND DISCUSSION

Policy evaluation is a crucial stage in the public policy cycle that serves to assess the effectiveness, efficiency, and impact of a policy that has been implemented. Through evaluation, policymakers and stakeholders can obtain valid and objective information on the extent to which policy objectives are achieved and the obstacles encountered during implementation. This is very important to ensure that the policies taken really provide optimal benefits to the community and can be used as a basis for future policy improvements. In the context of this study, policy evaluation is carried out by considering various aspects of policy performance, including effectiveness, efficiency, adequacy, equity, responsiveness and accuracy. The evaluation approach used refers to the theory of policy evaluation developed by experts, such as William Dunn, which emphasizes the importance of not only assessing policy outcomes, but also examining the values underlying those policies. Thus, this evaluation is not only descriptive, but also analytical and critical.

The reason why the zoning system policy at the state high school level has not been properly implemented in Balikpapan City is mainly due to the imbalance between the number and distribution of public schools and the growth in the number of prospective students in various sub-districts. Balikpapan has limited capacity for public schools, especially in densely populated districts such as East Balikpapan, which has only one public high school, so many students cannot be accepted into nearby schools and are forced to look for schools in other districts or private schools with higher costs. In addition, the uneven distribution of public schools causes the emergence of favorite schools that are full of interest and other schools that are less in demand, so that the zoning system actually limits the access of outstanding students who are domiciled some distance from the favorite school. This causes unfair access to education and unfair competition between parents of students. Other problems that arise are zoning rules that are not fully in accordance with field conditions, such as admission quotas that are disproportionate to school capacity and administrative constraints such as the period of domicile in the Family Card that affect the registration of new students. The lack of supporting facilities and data verification also worsened the implementation of the zoning system in Balikpapan. Therefore, many parties, including members of the Balikpapan DPRD and the East Kalimantan DPRD, consider it necessary to conduct a thorough evaluation of this zoning policy, with a focus on increasing the capacity of public schools, equitable distribution of educational facilities, and adjusting zoning rules to be more fair and

effective for all students in Balikpapan. This study aims to evaluate the policy of the zoning system in the admission of new students (PPDB) using the theoretical framework of William Dunn's policy evaluation. The evaluation approach proposed by Dunn covers various aspects, while the policy evaluation criteria developed according to Dunn's theory include: 1) Effectiveness; 2) Efficiency; 3) adequacy; 4) Equity; 5) Responsiveness and 6) Accuracy.

Effectiveness

Effectiveness in policy evaluation is a measure of the extent to which a policy achieves a predetermined goal or objectives. Effective policy evaluations assess the outcomes achieved, benefits, and impacts of policies, and consider costs and unintended consequences. This evaluation helps to improve the quality of policies and ensure that they are effective in achieving the desired objectives. Effectiveness is a benchmark in the implementation of a policy, the extent to which the program or policy runs according to the desired objectives. In measuring the level of effectiveness, it requires precision because there are objectives that are objective to the wider community and abstract (Lestanata & Pribadi, 2017). Based on the results of the research, the implementation of the zoning system policy in New Student Admissions (PPDB) has gone quite well, in accordance with the guidelines of Permendikbud No. 51 of 2018 (Ministry of Education and Culture, 2018). Although there are still pros and cons for the community, especially the parents of prospective new students. So far, it cannot be said that the policy has been effective in achieving its main goal, which is the equal distribution of the quality of education, this is due to the limitations of educational infrastructure, especially at the public high school level in the city of Balikpapan, so that it cannot accommodate the large number of prospective new students who register.

Efficiency

Efficiency in policy evaluation means measuring the extent to which a policy achieves its goals by using the least amount of resources. Efficiency evaluations aim to ensure that policies deliver the best results at the lowest cost, including the cost of time, human resources, and financial resources. According to Dunn (1999: 608-609) Efficiency is related to efforts to produce a certain level of effectiveness. Furthermore, Dunn (1999: 608-609), revealed that one of the important functions of policy evaluation is to provide valid, reliable information on the performance of a policy, namely how far the needs, values, opportunities and goals achieved by a public action are achieved. Thus, evaluations can reveal how far certain policy goals and targets are being achieved and solve problems. Based on the conditions that occur in the field, the registration process carried out online can reduce administrative costs, but there is system overload during the registration period, which makes most parents have to access the PPDB portal many times.

Adequacy

Adequacy in policy evaluation refers to the extent to which a policy meets existing needs, values, or opportunities, so that it can satisfy existing problems. The adequacy criterion emphasizes the strong relationship between policy alternatives and expected outcomes, as well as the ability of the policy to address existing problems. Adequacy in public policy is a goal that is expected to be sufficient in various aspects (Panggulu, 2013). In terms of the implementation of the impact felt by prospective students, only some people feel the positive impact of this zoning system. It is a good luck for prospective students who live within a close distance of the school because it makes it easier for them to enter public schools even though the test scores obtained are relatively low, inversely proportional to prospective students whose residence is quite far away, it is a little more difficult to enter public schools. Moreover, in Balikpapan City, not all sub-districts have State High Schools. However, in addition to the zoning pathway at the State High School level in the city of Balikpapan, there is also an achievement pathway for both academic and non-academic, affirmation, and tahfidz qur'an, which allows prospective students to take opportunities on this pathway.

Equitable

Equity in public policy evaluation refers to the measurement of how fairly and evenly a policy provides benefits and impacts to various groups of society. This evaluation ensures that the policy is not only effective overall, but also proportionately reaches all levels of society without discrimination. This means that policies must be designed and implemented to reduce social and economic disparities, as well as ensure that everyone has equal access to resources and opportunities. In terms of the zoning system policy in the city of Balikpapan itself, there is still an injustice where students with high academic scores but domiciled far lose competition with students with close domiciles who have lower scores and there are also still the use of fictitious work mutation letters and buying and selling seats to meet the zoning requirements, or moving their names to family cards so that they can be accepted by the school that is the sub-district zone.

Responsiveness

According to William N. Dunn, responsiveness is concerned with how far a policy can meet the needs, preferences, or values of a particular group of people (Lejiu & Irawan, 2017). Success in a policy is also seen from the response or response from the community. A positive response can be accepted by the community in the form of support, on the other hand, if the response given by the community is negative, it usually takes the form of rejection. In the city of Balikpapan itself, there are still many responses from parents and students who complain about the inflexibility of the zoning system, but the Balikpapan local government has begun to open affirmation and achievement pathways to accommodate these complaints. In its implementation, there is also a call center that aims to accommodate and answer questions from the community.

Accuracy

Accuracy refers to the value of the program or policy objectives that underlie those objectives. The results that show the value of the benefits of the policy will be compared with the original purpose and objectives of the policy so that it can show whether the policy is appropriate or not appropriate for the target (Lejiu & Irawan, 2017). Overall, the zoning system policy at the PPDB at the State High School level in the city of Balikpapan is still not on target. Because there is still the *government's* unpreparedness in meeting the distribution of public school infrastructure in each sub-district, it has reaped many contradictions from the community. In addition, there is still an uneven distribution of the quality of education, while zoning focuses more on the distribution of students, not improving the quality of schools. However, when viewed from its positive impact, this zoning system can minimize transportation costs.

CONCLUSION

The zoning system is a system that divides certain areas according to their geographical location. In this case, what is intended is a zoning system in the admission of new students, based on the domicile of each prospective student in the area that has been determined. This aims to achieve equal distribution of the quality of education. Every policy that has been implemented certainly requires evaluation so that in the future it can support the policy to achieve the expected goals. From the policy evaluation that has been carried out, the implementation of the zoning system policy in the Admission of New Students (PPDB) at the State High School level in Balikpapan City Based on the analysis with William Dunn's policy evaluation theory approach: PPDB Zoning in Balikpapan City is effective in expanding access to education, but it is not fully efficient and has not been sufficient in overcoming the gap in education quality. The aspect of justice has improved, but it is not yet fully fair for students in suburban areas. The government's responsiveness to the aspirations of the community is quite good, with adjustments to the registration

pathway scheme. To be precise, zoning still needs to be refined in order to not only regulate the distribution of students, but also improve the quality of education in all schools.

REFERENCES

- Admin. (2022, June 29). Legislator: PPDB sistem Zonasi di Balikpapan tak bermasalah. www.daulatnews.com.
<https://www.daulatnews.com/index.php/2022/06/30/legislator-ppdb-sistem-zonasi-di-balikpapan-tak-bermasalah/>
- Antisipasi masalah PPDB, Parlindungan minta Disdikbud Balikpapan lakukan treatment. (2023, July 17). kaltimtoday.co. [https://kaltimtoday.co/antisipasi masalah-ppdb-parlindungan-minta-disdikbud-balikpapan-lakukan-treatment](https://kaltimtoday.co/antisipasi-masalah-ppdb-parlindungan-minta-disdikbud-balikpapan-lakukan-treatment)
- Arumanto. (2024, Juli 4). Pj Gubernur Kaltim sidak dugaan kecurangan PPDB di Balikpapan. [https://kaltim.antaranews.com/berita/215388/pj-gubernur kaltim-sidak-dugaan-kecurangan-ppdb-di-balikpapan](https://kaltim.antaranews.com/berita/215388/pj-gubernur-kaltim-sidak-dugaan-kecurangan-ppdb-di-balikpapan) <https://kaltim.antaranews.com/berita/215388/>
- BalPos. (2023, June 9). PPDB dan Gelombang Permasalahannya - Balpos. PPDB Dan Gelombang Permasalahannya - Balpos. [https://www.balpos.com/pendidikan/1793001475/PPDB-dan-Gelombang Permasalahannya](https://www.balpos.com/pendidikan/1793001475/PPDB-dan-Gelombang-Permasalahannya)
- Berita Kaltim terkini.com. (2024, November 5). Nurhadi Saputra sebut ada ketidakseimbangan jumlah sekolah di Balikpapan. <https://www.beritakaltimterkini.com/2024/11/05/nurhadi-saputra-sebut-ada-ketidakseimbangan-jumlah-sekolah-di-balikpapan/>
- Fadillah, A. F. (2023, June 3). Dialog Warga dengan Wahidah, Warga Ungkap Sistem zonasi tak adil (B. Irawan, Ed.). [pusaranmedia.com](https://pusaranmedia.com/read/20400/dialog-warga-dengan-wahidah-warga-ungkap-sistem-zonasi-tak-adil). [https://pusaranmedia.com/read/20400/dialog-warga-dengan-wahidah-warga ungkap-sistem-zonasi-tak-adil](https://pusaranmedia.com/read/20400/dialog-warga-dengan-wahidah-warga-ungkap-sistem-zonasi-tak-adil)
- Fish, 2020; Maesarini & Samsudin, 2023; Peraturan et al., 2024; Safitri & Yusran, 2021)
- Fish, B. (2020). Evaluasi Kebijakan Sistem Zonasi Dalam Penerimaan Peserta Didik Baru Tingkat Smp Negeri Di Kota Surabaya. 2507(February), 1–9.
- Intoniswan. (2023, November 29). Masyarakat Kaltim Keluhkan Sistem Zonasi di PPDB, Beasiswa Kaltim Tuntas dan Perbaikan Sekolah yang Lambat. Niaga.Asia. <https://www.niaga.asia/masyarakat-kaltim-keluhkan-sistem-zonasi-di-ppdb-beasiswa-kaltim-tuntas-dan-perbaikan-sekolah-yang-lambat/>
- KaltimAktual. (2024, Oktober 31). Jumlah SMP dan SMA Negeri Jomplang, Nurhadi: Masalah Pendidikan di Balikpapan Udah Urgent Banget. <https://kaltimfaktual.co/jumlah-smp-dan-sma-negeri-jomplang-nurhadi-masalah-pendidikan-di-balikpapan-udah-urgent-banget/>
- Maesarini, I. W., & Samsudin. (2023). Evaluasi Kebijakan Pendidikan Melalui Sistem Zonasi Di Indonesia Program Studi Administrasi Publik , Fakultas Ilmu Administrasi Institut Ilmu Sosial dan Manajemen STIAMI , Indonesia. *Jurnal Ilmu Administrasi Publik*, 3(6), 679–686.
- Peraturan, B., Pendidikan, M., Tahun, N., Kebijakan, T., Zonasi, S., Peserta, P., & Baru, D. (2024). *Acc*, 30/12/2024. 2024.
- Safitri, M. A., & Yusran, R. (2021). Evaluasi Kebijakan Penerimaan Peserta Didik Baru (PPDB) dengan Sistem Zonasi pada SMA Negeri di Kota Padang. *Journal of Civic Education*, 4(1), 92–100.
<https://doi.org/10.24036/jce.v4i1.436>
- Puji Setyowati Akui Pemberlakuan Sistem Zonasi PPDB di Kaltim Alami Kendala. (n.d.). Website DPRD Provinsi Kalimantan Timur. [https://dprd.kaltimprov.go.id/post/puji-setyowati-akui-pemberlakuan-sistem zonasi-ppdb-di-kaltim-alami-kendala](https://dprd.kaltimprov.go.id/post/puji-setyowati-akui-pemberlakuan-sistem-zonasi-ppdb-di-kaltim-alami-kendala)
- <https://updatenusanantara.id/polemik-zonasi-pendidikan-di-balikpapan-damayanti-evaluasi-menyeluruh-dibutuhkan/>
- <https://lintasraya.com/zonasi-ppdb-di-balikpapan-terkendala-minimnya-sekolah-negeri/>
- <https://barometerkaltim.id/evaluasi-sistem-zonasi-di-balikpapan-damayanti-soroti-ketidakadilan-akses-pendidikan/>