

## Comparative Translation Quality Of Religious Terms In Umberto Eco's *The Name Of The Rose*

Mohamad Fauzi Agung Pamuji <sup>1</sup>, Wiwin Indiarti <sup>2</sup>, Arin Inayah <sup>3</sup>

<sup>1,2,3</sup> English Educational Department, Language and Art Faculty, PGRI University of Banyuwangi  
Email: fap1412@gmail .com

---

### Abstract

This research is a comparative study of translation using descriptive qualitative approach. It aims at examining the quality (accuracy and acceptability levels) of religious terms translation of two translation works of an outstanding qualities novel written by Umberto Eco entitle *The Name of the Rose*. To be exact, this research aimed to: 1). Measure the translation accuracy and acceptability of religious terms in *The Name of the Rose* published by Jalasutra, 2). Measure the translation accuracy and acceptability of religious terms in *The Name of the Rose* published by Bentang Pustaka, and 3). Describe the differences and similarities of the translation accuracy and acceptability of religious terms published by Jalasutra and Bentang Pustaka. The research data are religious terms found in *The Name of the Rose* which is collected using documentation method. The collected data are analyzed by using three following steps, 1). Comparing, 2). Describing and 3). Reporting. To assess translation accuracy and acceptability, the researcher used the translation quality assessment instruments by Prof. Mangatur Nababan. The research results that the translation accuracy and acceptability of *The Name of the Rose* published by Jalasutra and Bentang Pustaka are good. Both provide accurate translation of religious terms since they successfully translate 321 terms accurately. However, Bentang Pustaka translates 14 terms less accurately and 6 terms with inaccurate while Jalasutra translates 10 terms less accurately and 10 terms with inaccurate. The different quality of accuracy and acceptability was due to the translators' different consideration between maintaining the accuracy and acceptability level or reaching high readability translation. The conclusion is that Bentang Pustaka provides better translation than Jalasutra.

**Keyword:** Translation quality, Comparative Study, Religious Terms, *The Name of the Rose*

---

### A. Introduction

Generally, translating means transferring meanings (messages) and forms of a unit of translation from source language (SL) to target language (TL). It is in line with what had been stated by Nida and Taber (in *The Theory and Practice of Translation*, 1982:12) that translation is effort to produce the closest natural equivalent of the SL's message to TL's form, both in terms of meaning, and style. Whereas, Newmark (in Fitria, 2018) defined translating is providing meaning of

SL text to TL as expected by the author. In other words, translating means converting a text from SL to TL while preserving the meaning.

A translation is a product of translating. A good translation is a quality translation. Shuttleworth and Cowie (in Savitri, 2018) stated that the translation quality is influenced by the translation accuracy, acceptability, and readability. Those three factors are determined mostly by a translator's competences in linguistics and the disciplines being discussed in the will-be-translated work (Nababan in Azti, et al, 2019).

The first factor influencing the translation is accuracy measured from the extent to which the translation matches the original. Accuracy refers to a proper understanding of SL messages and conveying the messages as accurate as possible to TL (Larson in Aresta et al., 2018). A translation is said to be accurate if the meaning is transferred completely without any addition or subtraction. The second influencing factor, acceptability refers to how acceptable the translation result in culture, norms and rules of TL (Nababan in Prasetya, et al, 2018). It determines the appropriateness of translation in TL. The third factor which is influential to the translation quality, readability, according to Richards et al. (in Simanjuntak, 2019) is a measure of easiness or difficulty a translation can be read and understood (how easy a translation can be digested by its readers). Therefore, a translation will be considered as having quality if it meets the three criteria of good translation.

Since translating is a complicated process during which the messages or meanings of SL must be conveyed into TL, then comparing two translation products based on one work is quite challenging. Moreover if the work being translated is the one with outstanding quality such as Umberto Eco's novel entitled *The Name of The Rose*. It belongs to one of the novels having outstanding qualities. It is translated into many languages because of the high linguistic value. The novel discusses various problems related to middle ages such conflict between the King of Europe and Pope Johannes up to various types of religious ceremonies that must be carried out routinely in a Catholic monastery. The nuances of religious which is so thick leading the researcher to sharpen the research focus only on the quality of translations accuracy and acceptability of religious terms in two translations. The two versions of translation that are compared are published by Jalasutra and Bentang Pustaka. Based on the background, the researcher conduct a research entitled "Comparative Translation Quality of Religious Terms in Umberto Eco's *The Name of the Rose*."

## B. Research Method

### 1. Research Design

This research is a comparative study of translation that directly compares two translation products. The data examined are the product of the translation of the English version of *The Name of the Rose* which has been translated into Indonesian by different translators and printed by different publishers. The focus of this research is centered on the levels of accuracy and acceptability of the translated text. This research is categorized as a

descriptive qualitative one that aims to provide descriptive research conclusions.

## 2. The Research Area

This research is also included in a single case study; a research with one data source, *The Name of the Rose* and two translations in Indonesian. Eventhough there are two translation version, they can be said as one because based on the same work. The data used in this study include lingual units at the level of words and phrases that include religious terms from the novel and its two translations.

## 3. The Research Respondent

The focus of this research is centered on the levels of accuracy and acceptability of the translated text. This research is categorized as a descriptive qualitative one that aims to provide descriptive research conclusions

## 4. Data Collection Method

Data collection method refers to the way the researcher collect data of the research. This thesis use documentation method. According to Sugiyono (in Sari 2019), it is a record of events that had passed, or can be texts, images and works. Related to the research, the researcher take the religious terms from the novel *The Name of the Rose*.

The data of this study were collected by using three steps. The first step is reading the whole text of *The Name of the Rose* and its two translation versions. The researcher read the novel and its two translation versions to find translation of the religious term. The second step is identifying the collected religious terms, making an inventory of the classified data and reporting the findings. The inventory of the classified data is the comparison of two translation versions. Then, the third step in collecting the data is classifying. The collected data are finally classified into their categories.

## 5. Data Analysis Method

The research data were analyzed by using the following steps. The first step of data analysis is comparing the collected data of two translations of *The Name of the Rose*. The data that were compared are units at the level of words and phrases. The researcher compare the quality of the two translations by using Nababan's computation. The second step of data analysis is giving a description of valuation results. The third step is reporting the research result. Researcher provide comparison of translated terms and discribe the similarities and differences of religious terms that being translated.

## C. Conclusion

This research finds out that the translation quality of *The Name of the Rose* published by JST and by BPT are good translation. Both provide accurate and

acceptable translation. This researcher found 341 data of religious terms in *The Name of the Rose*.

After doing the data analysis, the researcher makes conclusions based on the research problems. The first is about the translation quality (accuracy and acceptability) of religious terms in *The Name of the Rose* published by JST. The second is the translation quality (accuracy and acceptability) of religious terms in *The Name of the Rose* published by BPT. The third is which translation of religious terms in *The Name of the Rose* performs better quality in accuracy and acceptability.

In the first analysis, From 341 religious terms in novel, 321 terms are translated by JST accurately and acceptably (94,13%), 10 terms less accurate (2,93%), and 10 terms Inaccurate and unacceptable (2,93%). The average of translation accuracy is 2,91 and acceptability is 2,90 or the average for translation quality (accuracy and acceptability) is 2,90. The scale 2,1-3 is categorized as good translation.

In the second analysis, from 341 religious terms in the novel, 321 terms are translated by JST accurately and acceptably (94,13%), 14 terms less accurate (4,11%), and 6 terms Inaccurate and unacceptable (1,76%). The average of translation accuracy is 2,94 and acceptability is 2,94 or the average for translation quality (accuracy and acceptability) is 2,94. It shows that BPT translation is categorized as good translation..Atlast, based on two previous analyzes, it shows that both translations are categorized as good translation. Nevertheless, translation by BPT is better than JST.

## D. Acknowledgement

All praises and gratitude due to Allah subhanahu wa ta'ala, God of the universe for His grace and guidance to me to complete this thesis entitled "Comparative Translation Quality of Religious Terms in Umberto Eco's *The Name of the Rose*". Peace be upon to the last messenger, Muhammad shallallahu 'alaihi wa sallam and his companions. I would like to express my sincere appreciation to everyone who have contributed to this thesis and supported me to finish it. I would like profound gratitude to:

1. Sutami Dwi Lestari, M.Pd. as the Dean of Language and Art Faculty.
2. Nur Hasibin, M.Pd. as the Head of English Educational Department
3. Wiwin Indarti, S.S., M. Hum. and Arin Inayah, S.S, M.Pd. as the consultants who always give commands, corrections, and suggestion.

There are no words can express my feelings. may God repay the kindness you have done to me so far.

## E. Reference

- Abbot (n.d.). In Dictionary.Cambridge.org dictionary. Retrieved from <https://dictionary.cambridge.org/dictionary/english/abbot>
- Aji, W., Nababan, M. R., & Santosa, R. (2017). Comparative Translation Quality of Judgement In Novel *The Adventures Of Tom Sawyer* (Sistemic Fuctional

- Linguistic in Translation Studies). *Lingua Didaktika: Jurnal Bahasa dan Pembelajaran Bahasa*, 11(1), 36-52.
- Alghamdi, R. (2016). *Translating Religious Terms and Culture in "The Sealed Nectar"*. UK: University of Leeds.
- Aresta, R., Nababan, M. R., & Djatmika, D. (2018). The Influence of Translation Techniques on the Accuracy and Acceptability of Translated Utterances that Flout the Maxim of Quality. *Humaniora*, 30(2), 176-191.
- Arkitraf. (n.d.). In *Kbbi.Kemdikbud.go.id dictionary*. Retrieved from <https://kbbi.kemdikbud.go.id/entri/arkitraf>
- Ahrenberg, L. (2017). Comparing Machine Translation and Human Translation: a Case Study. In *RANLP 2017: The First Workshop on Human-Informed Translation and Interpreting Technology, HiT-IT*, 21-28.
- Architrave (n.d.). In *Merriam-Webster's collegiate dictionary*. Retrieved from <https://www.merriam-webster.com/dictionary/architrave>
- Azti, I. F., Nababan, M. R., & Djatmika, D. (2019). The Analysis of the Results of Acceptability on the Translation Results in the Unedited Version and Edited Version in the Novel "After You." *International Journal of Multicultural and Multireligious Understanding*, 6(4), 422-432.
- Fatmawati, F. I., & Setiawan, T. (2019). Kualitas Terjemahan Lirik Lagu "Munajat Cinta" Bahasa Indonesia-Jawa. *Widyaparwa*, 47(1), 11-20.
- Fish, David. (2017) Book Review: *The Name of the Rose* by Umberto Eco. Retrieved from <https://medium.com/@dsfish/book-review-the-name-of-the-rose-by-umberto-eco-265be0c09e79>
- Fitria, T. N. (2018). Translation Technique of English Abstract Translation in *Journal Edunomika In 2018. English and Literature Journal*, 5(2), 145-160.
- Hariyanto, S. (2015). *Website Translation (second edition)*. Malang: Gerai Dinar Malang.
- Hashemian, M., & Arezi, A. (2017). A Study of Applied Strategies in Translating Idiomatic Expressions in Two Movie Subtitles: *Bring It On & Mean Girls*. *Research in English Language Pedagogy*, 3(2), 80-93.
- Herlambang, M. A. K. (2017). *A Study of Translation Equivalence and Acceptability on the Subtitle of Intel Advertisements*. Depok: Sanata Dharma University.
- Herman, Juniyati, R. (2019). An English Oblique Translation Analysis of "Twitter" Social Networking Website into Indonesian: An Applied Linguistics Study. *International and Public Affairs*, 3 (1), 6-12.
- Indiarti, W., & Wangi, W. (2015) *Tingkat Keberterimaan Tejemahan Istilah Budaya Osing: Sebuah Studi Kasus Terpancang*. Ranah: *Jurnal Kajian Bahasa*. 4 (1), 22.
- Japhari, S. (2019). Translation of the Book Titled 'Authentication of Hadith: Redefining the Criteria' from English into Swahili: An Analysis of Translation Procedures. *International Journal of Linguistics, Literature and Translation (IJLLT)*.
- Karina, L. (2018). An Analysis of Translation Strategies Found in *New Moon into Dua Cinta* by Monica Dwi Chresnayani. Surakarta: Universitas Muhammadiyah Surakarta.
- Mardliyah, S. A. (2018). *Translation Technique and Its Acceptability of Islamic Terms in Negeri 5 Menara Novel*. Jakarta : UIN Syarif Hidayatullah.

- Nababan, M., & Nuraeni, A. (2012). Pengembangan Model Penilaian Kualitas Terjemahan. Surakarta: Sebelas Maret University.
- Nida, E. A., & Taber, C. R. (Eds.). (1982). *The Theory and Practice of Translation* (Vol. 8). Brill Archive.
- Prafitasari, A., Nababan, M. R., & Santosa, R. (2019). An Analysis of Translation Technique and Translation Quality in Poem Book Entitled Love & Misadventure. *IJELTAL (Indonesian Journal of English Language Teaching and Applied Linguistics)*, 3(2), 313-333.
- Prasetya, I. Z., Hartono, R., & Yuliasri, I. (2019). Accuracy, Readability and Acceptability in the Translation of Android Xiaomi Redmi Note 4. *English Education Journal*, 9(3), 382-390.
- Sari, M. (2019). Analysis of Poetry Images in Antologi Sastra Lelaki di Gerbang Kampus by Gemasastrin Students. In *Proceeding of The International Conference on Literature*, 1(1), 491-498.
- Savitri, Y., Suparman, ujang., & Yufrizal, H. (2018). An Analysis of Students' Translation Quality (Accuracy, Readability and Acceptability) in Translating An Informative Text Entitled Yseali to Indonesian. Bandar Lampung: University of Lampung.
- Simanjuntak, F. (2019). A Study on Quality Assessment of the Translation of an Abstract Text English Idioms Errors Made by Jordanian EFL Undergraduate Students by Google Translate. *Online Submission*, 2(4), 38-49.
- Soemanto, Nin Bakdi (Translator). (2008). *The Name of the Rose*. Yogyakarta: Benteng Pustaka.
- Suparyati, Ani & Sobar Hartini (Translators). (2004). *The Name of the Rose*. Yogyakarta: Jalasutra.
- Suryawinata, Z., & Hariyanto, S. (2016). *Translation: Bahasan Teori & Penuntun Praktis Menerjemahkan (Edisi Revisi)*. Malang: MNC.
- Translate. (n.d.). In *Dictionary.Cambridge.org dictionary* Retrieved from <https://dictionary.cambridge.org/dictionary/english/translate>
- Translate. (n.d.). In *Merriam-Webster.com dictionary*. Retrieved from <https://www.merriam-webster.com/dictionary/translate>
- Trinitas. (n.d.). In *Kbbi.Kemdikbud.go.id dictionary*. Retrieved from <https://kbbi.kemdikbud.go.id/entri/trinitas>
- Tritunggal. (n.d.). In *Kbbi.Kemdikbud.go.id dictionary*. Retrieved from <https://kbbi.kemdikbud.go.id/entri/tritunggal>
- Tyulenev, S. (2017). Introduction: Toward Comparative Translation and Interpreting Studies. *Translation and Interpreting Studies*. 12(2). 197-212.
- Weaver, William. (1983). *The Name of the Rose*. US: Harcourt.